



Judgements and Truth. Essays in Honour of Jan Woleński

E. Lisanyuk

To cite this article: E. Lisanyuk (2021): Judgements and Truth. Essays in Honour of Jan Woleński, History and Philosophy of Logic, DOI: [10.1080/01445340.2021.1984013](https://doi.org/10.1080/01445340.2021.1984013)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/01445340.2021.1984013>



Published online: 12 Oct 2021.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)

BOOK REVIEW

A. SCHUMANN, editor. *Judgements and Truth. Essays in Honour of Jan Woleński*. London: College Publications, 2020. 334 pp., \$19.00. ISBN 978-1848903494.

Reviewed by E. LISANYUK, *St Petersburg State University, Petersburg 199034 Mendeleevskaya liniya, 5, e.lisanuk@spbu.ru, and National Research University Higher School of Economics, 21/4 Staraya Basmannaya St., 105066, Moscow, Russia, elisanyuk@hse.ru.*

© 2021 A. Schumann.

The volume assembles a remarkable topical diversity of papers collected on the occasion of the 80th anniversary of Professor Jan Woleński's (Jan Hertrich-Woleński), an eminent Polish analytic philosopher and logician, by his university colleague Andrew Schumann. The volume continues a tradition of academic birthday gifts and contains 13 essays authored by the contemporary researchers most of whom are from Poland, two from Brazil and one from Germany. The contributed papers were initially published as an issue of *Studia Humana* (9, 3/4, 2020).

In the Introduction by A. Schumann, its reader finds a concise biography of J. Woleński outlined with due respect of a younger colleague for his preceptor. Gently lemmatic in relation to the contents of the volume, Introduction gives some hints which will keep its readers from being disappointed by the broad coverage of issues of the essays amid the high selectivity of its contributors. One of those hints is an archaeological look at the genesis of logic which A. Schumann develops in his research of the ancient roots of logic and relies on it in his view of J. Woleński's legacy as an unwearied pursuit to study the famous Lvov-Warsaw, or simply Polish, school of logic. The principal topics of its studies, tacitly mentioned as the research interests of the hero of the volume, can be seen as another hint. The school had flourished in the first half of the XXth c.; its research topics included reistic formal ontology, semanticist studies of language and grammar, realized mostly in the non-cognitivist vein, and a theory of practical action involving deontological elaboration of values and norms. The school included such well-known logicians as A. Tarski (1901–1983), S. Leśniewski (1886–1939), J. Łukasiewicz 1878–1956), S. Jaśkowski (1906–1965) and etc., whose ideas to a large extent have shaped the contemporary philosophical logic. If the school were to exist today, J. Woleński would have been its respected member according to his research interests or their conceptual development irrespectively of whether the school is viewed in terms of its historical evolution or evolution of its special methodological approaches. Some contributors (p. 218) call him 'the leading continuator' of the school.

J. Woleński was born in Poland in 1940. For the most of his academic life he is affiliated to the Jagiellonian University in Kraków from where in 1963 he first graduated with a degree in law and again in 1964 – with a degree in philosophy, and where he defended his doctoral dissertation in 1968 and habilitation in 1972, both in legal philosophy. At the present he is a professor emeritus of his alma mater and a professor at the University of Information Technology and Management in Rzeszow (Poland).

Analytical legal philosophy and its logical aspects including deontic logic are remaining among key J. Woleński's research areas. Academic databases suggest about 100 records of J. Woleński's works, papers and books, published since 1990-ies, and, if put together with roughly the same amount of works published in the pre-digital period of 1960–1990-ies, they could made a voluminous edition of his research legacy revolving around the problem of truth in a variety of issues in philosophy and history of logic with the notable focus on their developments in the Lvov-Warsaw school. A. Schumann rightly emphasizes the international character of J. Woleński's academic as well as social activities in publishing, conference organizing and participating, editing of journals and books, which made him one of the internationally renowned faces of the Polish philosophy, both as a scholar and as an organizer of academic scholarship. My first encounter with J. Woleński dates back to 1990-ies when as a logic student I was reading *Studia Logica*, one of the most influential logical journals, of which he had been Editor-in-Chief at that time. Later we met in person many times on different academic occasions, including the biennial conferences Logic Today in St Petersburg (Russia) in which J. Woleński have taken part as a keynote speaker.

There can be three reasons for reading a Festschrift volume: to get acquainted with the studies of a hero of the day, with the state of art in his or her area of research; or with the impact on that area produced by the research community which he or she represents. 'Judgements and Truth' falls under the third category, and I would recommend reading it to those interested in the contemporary Polish analytic philosophy and philosophy of logic. Ten essays out of thirteen in the volume are written by Polish authors, most of them review discussions in the Polish community and contain collections of references to the relevant papers of Polish philosophers from outside of the volume. However, as the Polish contributors refer to J. Woleński's and other Polish authors' papers published in Polish, for international readers, that path of familiarizing themselves with the research output of the Polish philosophical community will not be straightforward.

The topics of the contributions span from history of AI (K. Trzęsicki) and medieval modalities (M. Treczyński) to the contemporary abstract logic (A. Costa-Leite and E. de Souza), and from philosophy of mathematics (S. Krajewski), formal phenomenology (J. Kaczmarek) to the development of the truth- (F. Schang), model- (J. Pogonowski) and diagram-bound (J.-Y. Beziau) logical relations.

According to J.-Y. Beziau, the author of one of the three papers in the volume contributed by non-Polish authors, there are three reasons author X may have for contributing a paper into a volume in honor of author Y (p. 44): (1) to discuss some work of Y; to suggest a result (2) directly or (3) indirectly related to the work of Y. Only three papers in the volume belong to the category (1). These are papers of F. Schang who considers J. Woleński's inclusive semantic reism about truth and his reservations against the coherence approaches to truth; of J. Pogonowski who shows how J. Woleński's generalization of the traditional square of oppositions with respect to the different logical notions of consistency contributes to the study of how models are (said to be) used in logic and mathematics; and of T. Jarmuzek and M. Klonowski who give a clear exposition of J. Woleński's naturalistic and non-linguistic standpoint about norms regarding the so-called Hume's guillotine. This exposition explains J. Woleński's doubt of the relevance of the Jorgensen's dilemma to deontic logic, a widely debated issue in analytic legal philosophy. That standpoint allows to treat norms of different sorts in a uniform manner as kinds of modal propositions capable of being true or false contrary to the warnings of analytical legal philosophers, according to which norms lack truth values and cannot be subjects of a logical study unless substituted by normative propositions which describe them.

Four papers in the volume, by K. Trzęsicki, R. Murawski, S. Krajewski, A. Costa-Leite and E. de Souza, have no explicit references to J. Woleński's ideas. The remaining six

papers fall under the categories (2) or (3), and most of them either clearly indicate why and in which respect the issues they pursue are related to the relevant ideas of J. Woleński or just mention some of his research results. Of those six papers, three deserve a special mention with respect to the occasion of the volume.

W. Krysztofiak's paper 'Logical Consequence Operators and Etatism' is connected to the research topics of both J. Woleński and the volume editor A. Schumann. W. Krysztofiak discusses the practical use of key deductive patterns of inference, such as *modus ponens* and others, in a non-traditional setting of how they affect the character of the social community, and labels their use as liberal, totalitarian and etc. J. Kazcmarek in his paper 'About Some New Methods of Analytical Philosophy. Formalization, De-formalization and Topological Hermeneutics' proposes a proto-ontology for certain notions, which he calls protological hermeneutics in the vein of Husserl- and, what is more relevant in this volume, of Ingarden-style of phenomenological study, given that Roman Ingarden (1893–1970), a leading Polish phenomenologist, was one of J. Woleński's teachers. J. Woleński's reistic standpoint is repercussed in an up-to-date diagrammatic way in the paper by J. Lemanski and M. Dobrzański who suggest a fresh look at A. Schopenhauer's mapping of the degrees of abstraction of concepts with the help of L. Euler-type diagrams.

Let me observe some shortcomings of the book. No index in it is a regrettable omission amid its broad topical scope. Another one has to do with one of today's top discussed social agenda of doing research. J. Woleński compares the impact of the Lvov-Warsaw school of logic on the contemporary philosophy to the impact on it of the famous Vienna circle. However, the school had a particular influence which the circle had lacked. From its very beginning, the Lvov-Warsaw school involved renowned female philosophers, such as Maria Kokoszyńska (1905–1981), Maria Ossowska (1896–1974) and others. The contemporary Polish philosophy is recognized for its successful continuation of this tradition neglected in the list of the authors, unfortunately.

The fact of assembling of such volume proves that the hero of the day has created a legacy deserving to be substantially discussed in it. 'Judgements and Truth' conveys an impression of a good collection of birthday presents, each of which is remarkable on its own. However, together they make up neither a book about J. Woleński's contribution to the contemporary philosophy, nor a book about his scholarly off-spring. Both of those ways of making a tribute are very much welcome on that sort of academic occasion, infinite many of which I wish Professor Jan Woleński to happily celebrate.

The support from the Russian Science Foundation, project # 20-18-00158 is kindly recognized.

ORCID

E. Lisanyuk  <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-0135-4583>